



Primary School Modernisation Plan

Penmaenrhos Area

Buildings Fit for Purpose Appraisal

Executive Summary

July 2012

Contents	Page
1.0 Introduction	3
2.0 Penmaenrhos Area and School Profiles	5
3.0 Option Development	7
4.0 Option Appraisal Methodology	8
5.0 Option Appraisal	9
6.0 Appraisal Results	14
7.0 Conclusions	16
8.0 Recommendation	18

Doc Ref	Status	Issue Date	Issued To	Prep By	Checked By
Rep 001	Draft for Comment	17 th May 2012	KRE/DH	RJH	DM
Rep 001A	Amended following comments from Education	13 th June 2012	KRE/DH	DM	RJH
Rep 001B	Amended following email from DH dated 19/06/12.	25 th June 2012	KRE/DH	RJH	DM
Rep 001C	Amended following comment from DH 05/07/12.	5 th July 2012	DH	RJH	RJH

1.0 Introduction

1.1 Background

Conwy County Borough Council has been carrying out an in-depth review of its Primary Schools over the last three years. This resulted in the publication of the “*Strategy for the Modernisation of Conwy Primary Schools*” and associated “*Implementation Plan*” in October 2010, following its adoption by Cabinet.

The Cabinet also agreed to:

- i) consult with communities in detail (full impact assessment) on the options within the Implementation Plan and,
- ii) undertake stakeholder meetings with those areas identifies for “review in two years time”.

Key information gathering including impact assessments on language, equality, transportation, community and buildings fit for purpose will be undertaken in order to inform a multi criteria benefits analysis.

Formal consultation meetings will take place with each school within each area for initial review to present in more detail the options considered for each area and the outcome of the option appraisal.

Due to changes in Welsh Government's 21st Century Programme, in September 2011, Conwy cabinet agreed a pause and review of the Primary School Modernisation Plan (PSMP) Implementation Plan as previously agreed (October 2010).

As a result of the pause and review, the updated “Strategy for the Modernisation of Conwy Schools Implementation Plan” consultation timetable was presented and approved by Cabinet on the 8th November 2011.

This resulted in the alignment of the PSMP Implementation Plan and the Authorities Strategic Outline Programme which was subsequently submitted to the Welsh Government on the 18th November 2011 and received approval in principal in December 2011.

Thereafter, the proposed strategic outline programme will be subject to robust challenge by the Welsh Government and followed by the submissions of business cases to Welsh Government. The full programme, if approved at all stages would then be implemented between 2014 to 2020.

1.2 Key Drivers

Taking into account the Welsh government aspirations, the Local Authority has developed a number of key drivers which form the brief for each area and consequent options developed to achieve the programme aims:

- Continued improvement of educational standards.
- Ensuring all of our buildings are “fit for purpose”.
- Reducing the number of unfilled places in our schools to acceptable levels.
- Ensuring that all pupils have equality of access to resources.

1.3 Underpinning Requirements

The 21st Century Schools Programme is a One Wales commitment and a unique collaboration between the Welsh Government, The Welsh Local Government Association and Local Authorities.

It is a major long term and strategic investment programme with the aim of creating a generation of 21st Century schools in Wales.

The programme will:

- Support a policy of “One Wales” in relation to schools.
- Drive improvements in educational standards through investment in schools.
- Align with post 16 transformation with wider public service investment and aims to be coherent across administrative boundaries and,
- Plans to create world class environments for teachers to teach and pupils to learn supported fully by ICT that are of high quality, designed for sustainability, built on time, at a reasonable cost to the taxpayer and are properly maintained over their lives.

2.0 Penmaenrhos Area and School Profile

2.1 Penmaenrhos Area

The settlement of Penmaenrhos is largely contained within the wards of Colwyn and Llysfaen along Peulwys Lane. There are two schools providing education for primary age pupils in the area, namely Ysgol Penmaenrhos (Infants) and Ysgol Tan Y Marian (Junior). The schools are approximately 0.4 of a mile apart.

The combined population of the two wards is 7,050. The number of dwellings within the catchment area of both schools is 1,337 with 3,488 dwellings within one mile of Ysgol Tan Y Marian and 3,789 dwellings within one mile of Ysgol Babanod Penmaenrhos.

Since the start of the Local Development Plan (LDP) period in 2007, 45 new dwellings have been completed in the Colwyn ward and 7 in Llysfaen. There are in addition two large sites with planning permissions for a total of 48 dwellings in the Colwyn ward.

Based on previous completion rates, we would anticipate approximately 70 dwellings in Colwyn and 13 in Llysfaen being built on small windfall sites through the remainder of the Plan Period.

In the Colwyn and Llysfaen wards, 355 dwellings are proposed on new allocated sites over the LDP Period. The bulk of these are located at the Ty Mawr Farm site (Llysfaen ward) with 255 dwellings which includes a Section 106 agreement.

An additional 70 dwellings are proposed in Llysfaen village itself, at two sites and 30 dwellings at Ysgol y Graig in Colwyn make up the remainder of the new allocations in this area.

A potential 24 further infant school pupils are associated with these extra dwellings in the Penmaenrhos catchment and a further potential 32 junior school pupils are associated with the new dwellings in the Tan Y Marian catchment.

The proposed options contained in this report include the potential for future expansion to accommodate the increase in demand resulting from these developments.

2.2 School Profiles

Ysgol Babanod Penmaenrhos

This school has a capacity of 81 pupil places. The current pupil population is 46 (Jan 2012 statistics) excluding nursery places. Currently the school has 33.5% unfilled pupil spaces and this is projected to remain static until 2017.

In overall terms the building is 135 square metres oversized, primarily in the non net areas, consisting of kitchen, toilets and circulation.

The Service Asset Management Plan states that the majority of the facilities achieve an overall condition Grade of B, defined as “operational but with minor essential maintenance requirements”.

The existing school building and site has some deficiencies which include:

- DDA access issues to the first floor accommodation.
- Constrained vehicular and pedestrian access, bounded by roads on three sides.
- No designated disabled parking bay
- Some potentially asbestos containing materials identified
- Kitchen installation requires upgrading / updating
- Poor energy efficiency
- Not compliant with current Building Bulletins in areas such as acoustics and day lighting.
- Restricted and undersized site.

Ysgol Tan Y Marian

The school is a predominantly English medium junior school serving pupils from 7 to 11 years old. It has the capacity to accommodate 120 pupils although the current pupil roll is much lower at 56 (Jan 2012 statistics)

The school has 50% unfilled spaces and presently growth predictions suggest that this figure will fall to 46% by 2017 with projected pupil numbers of 65.

The Service Asset Management Plan states that the majority of the facilities achieve an overall condition Grade of B, defined as “operational but with minor essential maintenance requirements”.

The existing school building and site has some deficiencies which include;

- Poorly sited school entrance
- Lack of some facilities such as a medical room
- Boiler plant requires upgrading / updating
- Kitchen installation requires upgrading / updating
- Poor energy efficiency
- Not compliant with current Building Bulletins in areas such as acoustics and day lighting.

3.0 Option Development

Options Considered

Prior to the issue of the Authorities Strategy for the Modernisation of Conwy Primary Schools document in October 2010, a number of scoping studies were undertaken to inform participants in the consultation process.

The results of this scoping were contained in an (internal departmental) Option Appraisal document produced in May 2010 and this document identified a number of feasibility options which formed the basis of the strategic options.

Education Services during the Primary School Modernisation Programme scoping studies identified the following structures for its schools for the future of Education delivery in Conwy.

Establish “All Through” Primary Schools

This involves the amalgamation of a junior and its feeder infant into one Primary school with one Head Teacher and Governing Body.

Establish an Area School on One-Site in Designated Geographical Areas

This refers to one school on a single site for an area. This would mean the closure of all schools in the area and the establishment on one school in a geographical area onto one site (this would be an existing or new site). The school would serve the communities across that area.

Establish an Area School on Multi-Sites in Designated Geographical Areas

This refers to one school on two or more sites for an area. This would mean the closure of all schools in the area and the establishment on one school in a geographical area on more than one existing site. The school would serve the communities across that area.

The three Strategic Options are:

Option 1 – Driver Led – Area School on one Site.

Option 2 – Maintain Current Schools on Existing Two Sites.

Option 3 – Area School on Existing Two Sites.

The strategic options were further developed for the two schools within the Penmaenrhos area and the following options were proposed;

Option 1 – All Through Primary School on Ysgol Tan Y Marian.

Option 2 – Maintain Ysgol Tan Y Marian and Ysgol Babanod Penmaenrhos on Existing two Sites.

Option 3 – All Through School Ysgol Tan Y Marian and Ysgol Babanod Penmaenrhos on Existing two Sites.

Options Commentary

Option 1 amalgamates the two existing schools on one site as a new All Through School on one new site.

Options 2 and 3 are identical from a buildings fit for purpose perspective, as the difference is the governance arrangements and not the structure of the schools.

All options address the surplus space available by minor reconfiguration to provide missing facilities, also providing more appropriately sized and located accommodation and address accessibility issues.

4.0 Option Appraisal Methodology

Scoring Matrix

The scoring matrix looked at wide ranging evaluation criteria which were scored and tabulated for each option. A value of between 1 and 5 was applied to each criterion with the higher score representing greater compliance with the ideal requirements.

The matrix encompassed a number of diverse criteria that comprise a thorough site, design, technical and financial analysis including:

- Site acquisition
- Building Bulletin guidance
- Flood risk and ground/contamination
- Site capacity
- Phasing complexity
- BREEAM compliance
- Future flexibility and experience
- Compliance with School Regulations
- Energy efficiency and utilities capacity
- Site access and DDA requirements

Comparative costs were prepared for all of the Options and these were calculated by using the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors Building Cost Information Service (BCIS).

This service provides current building costs for a variety of building types including educational buildings that are adjusted by size, topography and location.

These base costs have then been adjusted to reflect site specific factors and considerations including;

- Site Acquisition/Disposal
- Professional and Statutory Fees
- Decant/Temporary Accommodation
- BREEAM Costs
- Furniture, Fittings and Equipment & ICT
- Risk Allocations
- Inflation

The appraisals include Net Present Values (NPV) which have been used to compare costs and benefits that occur over a period of thirty years.

The NPV's include a discount rate of 3.5% which is used to convert all costs and benefits from different periods to "present day values" for comparison purposes.

The financial appraisal and evaluation is in accordance with the HM Treasury Green Book guidance titled "Appraisal and Evaluation in Central Government".

Option 1 has been calculated on the basis of a 50:50 split of Welsh Government and Conwy County Borough Council contributions.

Options 2 and 3 have been calculated on the basis of a 100% contribution from Conwy County Borough Council on the basis that the Authority believes these options would not qualify for Welsh Government funding as they do not meet the 21st Century Schools funding criteria.

5.0 Option Appraisal

There are three options for the Penmaenrhos Area which utilise the two existing school sites, either as an amalgamation onto one of the sites or by retaining both sites.

Option 1 All Through School on one site (Ysgol Tan Y Marian site)

This option meets the requirements for the driver-led strategic option with an Area School on one site amalgamating a junior and its feeder infant into one Primary school under one Head Teacher and Governing Body.

The Ysgol Tan Y Marian site is adequately sized and located with the flexibility to accommodate future expansion.



Figure 1 – Photograph of Existing School and Site

The building layout has been extended to provide additional classrooms, nursery accommodation and to form the new school entrance.

The main entrance to the school has been changed to the eastern end of the school and now accommodates the headteacher's office, reception, general office and medical room. The community facilities have been re-arranged to suit this arrangement without compromising the community need.

This provides one common entrance and gives the school a sense of identity.

Elsewhere, the staff room, ALN/Art/Food Technology and Library spaces have been repositioned to more suitable locations to meet the requirements of an all through school.



Figure 2 - Plan of Proposed 'All Through' School on Ysgol Tan Y Marian site

Other features shown in Figure 1 include a games area, habitat space, nursery play areas immediately adjacent to the nursery teaching space and some landscaping enhancements.

Expansion space is available at the end of the building for a further two classrooms if required in the future to meet any increase in demand from housing development.

Option 2 Maintain Current Schools on Existing Two Sites and Option 3 Area School on Existing Two Sites

These options maintain the status quo in terms of the two existing school buildings and their surrounds.

The building layouts at each school will be reconfigured to improve space utilisation and to overcome potential issues with accessibility.

At Ysgol Babanod Penmaenrhos, the staff room on the first floor is relocated to the ground floor to meet DDA requirements, leaving the upper floor space as storage.

On the ground floor, one of the existing classrooms is redesignated as a music/library space where the existing ICT/Music room becomes the staff room and the existing library becomes the new medical room.

At Ysgol Tan Y Marian, one classroom is lost to accommodate support spaces including a medical room, general office and reprographics room.

The existing Art/Food Technology space is reconfigured to provide a smaller Art/Food Technology space and a library which is being displaced by the staff room.

The original staff room becomes the Headteacher's office adjacent to the main entrance which is maintained in its current position.

These changes generally ensure accommodation meets the requirements at the expense of surplus classroom space.



Figure 3 – Plan of Maintain Current school/Area School on Existing Two Sites (Ysgol Babanod Penmaenrhos) site



Figure 4 – Plan of Proposed Current School/Area School on Existing Two Sites (Ysgol Tan Y Marian)

6.0 Appraisal Results

Summary

Following the detailed appraisal of the Options, we have tabulated the matrix results and financial outcomes for comparison below;

Option	Option Name	Matrix Score	Net Present Value	Construction Cost	Acquisition Cost
1	All Through School on Ysgol Tan Y Marian site	125	15,045,250	1,216,872	Nil
2	Maintain Current Schools on Existing Sites	122	16,182,870	452,764	Nil
3	All Through School on Existing Two Sites	122	15,304,180	452,764	Nil

Figure 5 – Tabulated Appraisal Results

Analysis of Matrix Results

The appraisal places the options in the following order;

- Option 1 All Through School
- Option 2 Maintain Current Schools on Existing Sites (Tied)
- Option 3 All Through School on Existing Two Sites (Tied)

The results suggest that Option 1 is the leader of the three options considered and whilst it achieved one less full score of five points on the criteria, it achieves higher scores on the remaining nine criteria.

Option 1 involves an element of new build and therefore has achieved greater credits for those criteria that are impacted upon by new construction;

- Brownfield or Greenfield Site
- Flexibility for Future Change
- Energy Efficiency Capacity
- Innovation in Design Features
- Associated Construction Risk

Conversely Options 2 and 3 score lower because there is no new build and there is limited ability to achieve credits in relation to BREEAM and Energy Efficiency.

Financial Outcomes

The financial evaluation has two main drivers, the estimated construction cost and the full cost of ownership expressed by the net present value calculations.

The estimated construction costs have been prepared for each option taking into account the site, constraints, phasing and the design proposals.

Option 1 All Through School on Ysgol Tan Y Marian £1,216,872

Option 2 Maintain Current Schools on Existing Sites £452,764

Option 3 All Through School on Two Existing Sites £452,764

These costs reflect the position that Option 1 involves new build accommodation and internal remodelling whilst the other options involve much reduced scopes of work and no new build accommodation.

Net Present Values

The Net Present Values are calculated from the total cost of the three Options over a thirty year period and considers the following main items;

- Capital Cost of Buildings/Equipment
- Annual Running Costs
- Annual R & M Fund
- Site Acquisition/Disposal/Residual Values

The Net Present Values for the three options are:

Option	Option Name	Net Present Value
Option 1	All Through School at Ysgol Tan Y Marian site	£15,045,250
Option 2	Maintain Current Schools on Existing Sites	£16,182,870
Option 3	All Through School on Existing Two Sites	£15,304,180

Figure 6 Net Present Values

The NPV figures in Figure 6 above are based in the case of Option 1 on a 50:50 funding split between the Welsh Government and Authority and for Options 2 & 3, 100% funded by the Authority.

Options 2 and 3 will not meet the funding criteria applied to the Primary School Modernisation project of estate rationalisation and the reduction in surplus pupil capacity.

The NPV ranking is;

- 1st - Option 1 All Through School at Ysgol Tan Y Marian site
- 2nd - Option 3 Maintain Current Schools on Existing Sites
- 3rd - Option 2 All Through School on Existing Two Sites

Options 2 and 3 have higher formula funding costs applied to the NPV calculations. Option 1 has the lowest NPV because it has a lower prudential borrowing requirement.

The NPV costs are higher for Options 2 and 3, particularly utility, maintenance and repair that are applied to a gross internal area for the two schools of 2,067 square metres as against an area of 1,199 square metres for the amalgamated school option.

The reserve and sinking funds are also lower for Option 1 as a result of a smaller gross internal floor area.

7.0 Conclusions

Three main options were identified during the consultation process and these were further developed and analysed with the aim of identifying which option would best address the initial brief in providing sites and buildings fit for purpose with capacity to meet the projected pupil numbers up to 2016.

All three options are feasible solutions and could deliver the buildings fit for purpose requirements of the PSMP.

However, some key distinctions can be drawn between the options as detailed below and these considerations have informed the recommendations:

Option 1 All Through School on Ysgol Tan Y Marian

- NPV – This has the lowest net present value, approximately £259k less expensive than Option 3 over the thirty year period and £1,137k less than Option 2.
- Build Costs – This option has the highest construction cost as it involves new build and remodelling works.
- Site – The site is owned by CCBC and therefore land ownership is not an issue. Any delay to the disposal of the former Ysgol Babanod Penmaenrhos site could affect the funding stream.

- Planning – Small extension which should not be a significant planning issue.
- Disruption – The more complex option in terms of phasing but impact can be managed by use of new accommodation for temporary decant.
- Issues – No significant issues at this stage of the process.
- Strategic Change – Organisational change as a result of the amalgamation of the two schools onto the one site.
- Transformation – Limited impact but some scope through accommodation changes and amalgamation of schools.
- Matrix - Highest appraisal matrix score but marginal at less than 3% and generally reflecting the fact that this option has the most construction work being undertaken, impacting on construction risk criteria.

Option 2 Maintain Current Schools on Existing Sites

- NPV – This has the highest net present value and is the most expensive option, approximately £1,137k more than Option 1 over the thirty year period.
- Build Cost – The construction costs are low, approximately a third of that in Option 1.
- Site – Both sites are in the ownership of CCBC, so no land ownership issues.
- Planning – No significant external alterations are proposed, so limited opportunity for planning issues.
- Disruption – This option involves minor internal re-arrangement of spaces and associated construction work, so the impact will be minimal.
- Issues – No significant issues have been identified at this stage of the process.
- Strategic Change – Limited organisational change as current structure is maintained.
- Transformation – Limited scope due to minimal new build or remodelled accommodation.
- Matrix - Lowest matrix score, tied with Option 3 with very limited energy efficiency and design innovation criteria scores reflecting limited impact of the works involved.

Option 3 All Through School on Two existing Sites

- NPV – This has the second lowest net present value by a marginal amount over the thirty year period.
- Build Costs - The construction costs are low, approximately a third of that in Option 1 and the same as Option 2.
- Site - Both sites are in the ownership of CCBC, so no land ownership issues.
- Planning - No significant external alterations are proposed, so limited opportunity for planning issues.
- Disruption - This option involves minor internal re-arrangement of spaces and associated construction work, so the impact will be minimal.
- Issues – No significant issues at this stage of the process.

- Strategic Change – Some organisational change as a result of the change to a single Head Teacher and Governing Body.
- Transformation - Limited impact but some scope through accommodation changes and amalgamation of schools.
- Matrix - Lowest matrix score, tied with Option 3 with very limited energy efficiency and design innovation criteria scores reflecting limited impact of the works involved.

8.0 Recommendation

On the basis of the Appraisal Matrix and the Financial Appraisal (NPV), the Authority is recommended to adopt the following strategy:

Option 1 All Through School on Ysgol Tan Y Marian site

Adopt this option as the leading option going forward as it has the highest score in the appraisal matrix and lowest NPV cost over the thirty year period.

The site has flexibility for future change and in common with the other options, has the potential for improved energy efficiency, as and when funds are available.

Option 3 All Through School on Two Existing Sites

This is tied with Option 2 in terms of its appraisal matrix score but has the second lowest NPV cost and should be considered if Option 1 is not selected for any reason.

This option has high prudential borrowing costs as for Option 2.

This option scores lower than Option 2 on the basis of the funding formula costs particularly staffing costs. From a building for purpose appraisal, there is little difference between this option and Option 2.

Option 2 Maintain Current Schools on Existing Sites

This is the third preferred option and whilst tied with Option 3 on the appraisal matrix, it has the highest NPV cost of the three options due to the funding formula and prudential borrowing costs.

In terms of the “buildings fit for purpose” appraisal, the content of this option is identical to Option 3.

The scope of the works is limited; hence it will not attract funding.